Facilitating students’ use of feedback for their academic, personal, and professional development

Dr Naomi Winstone
Reader in Higher Education & Head of Department
Department of Higher Education
@DocWinstone  @SurreyLab
What barriers to students’ use of feedback have you observed in your role as an Academic Tutor?
‘It’d be useful, but I wouldn’t use it’: barriers to university students’ feedback seeking and recipience

Naomi E. Winstone\textsuperscript{a}*, Robert A. Nash\textsuperscript{b}, James Rowntree\textsuperscript{a} and Michael Parker\textsuperscript{a}

\textsuperscript{a}School of Psychology, University of Surrey, Guildford, UK; \textsuperscript{b}School of Life and Health Sciences, Aston University, Birmingham, UK
Barriers to engagement

Building Feedback Literacy: The DEFT

(1) Feedback guide
(2) Feedback workshop
(3) Feedback portfolio


http://tinyurl.com/DEFTtoolkit
Assessment and feedback

- support students to review and reflect holistically on feedback they have received on assessed work, developing their ability to build on knowledge and progress successfully
- work with students to identify consistent patterns in feedback (e.g. poor referencing/structure, insecure research base, etc.)
- discuss the steps they can take to improve their performance in future assessments

How can Academic Tutors support students to:

1. Reflect upon feedback and manage emotional responses?
2. Synthesise feedback?
3. Take action in response to feedback?
REFLECTING UPON FEEDBACK AND MANAGING EMOTIONAL RESPONSES
Feedback and emotion

“We all want to meet our own expectations of ourselves, and so being critiqued – or even just the prospect of being critiqued – can present an enormous threat to our self-esteem and positive sense of identity.”
‘Managing’ emotion?
‘Managing’ emotion?

But I think most students, you get...you get your coursework back, you look at the mark. If it’s really good, you probably won’t read the feedback. If it’s not so great, you probably will look at it, and that’s about it.

I think you’re more likely to ignore [negative comments]. [Laughs] To save yourself, kinda thing!

## How feedback feels

Control-Value Theory (Artino & Pekrun, 2014)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activating Potential</th>
<th>Emotional Valence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Positive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activating</td>
<td>JOY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PRIDE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deactivating</td>
<td>RELIEF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CONTENTMENT</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Artino & Pekrun (2014) *Academic Medicine, 89*(12), 1696
How feedback feels

[Image of a hand-drawn diagram showing a cycle of coursework, feedback, and the struggle to improve.]

Winstone, Rees, Niculescu & Medland (in prep)
How do you feel when receiving feedback?
I can think of very few instances where the peer review process has not resulted in a vastly improved article. Yet even when armed with this knowledge, my initial responses to receiving critical feedback and rejection during peer review are remarkably consistent. I feel like the comments are a personal judgment of me and I often feel like an imposter inhabiting an academic role.
I liked the idea and the experiment but feel that it would have been much better with more effort.

Although rewriting and adding new experiments may be helpful, this would result in something that is more like an entirely new manuscript.
“Defanging Feedback”

http://philldawson.com/defanging-feedback-by-rewriting-into-action-items/

“However, I’ve found that when I make my first step rewriting the feedback comments into actionable todos for myself that this stops me from needing to affectively engage again. In rewriting I’m making them tasks I assign myself rather than critique – I’m ‘defanging’ the feedback. The emotional charge is mostly gone and I’m left with a set of todos”.

Supporting your students (2)
Using the DEFT to support students’ reflection on and emotional response to feedback

**Workshop:** Activity B3 (Using emotion positively)

**Portfolio:**
Reflecting on generic feedback
Reflecting on feedback over a term/semester
Reflecting on progress and the use of feedback
SYNTHESISING FEEDBACK
A Memory Advantage for Past-Oriented Over Future-Oriented Performance Feedback

Robert A. Nash  
Aston University

Naomi E. Winstone  
University of Surrey

Samantha E. A. Gregory  
Aston University

Emily Papps  
University of Surrey

10 Experiments (N = 852)

On average, only 3/20 comments recalled after a short delay

tinyurl.com/ForgottenFeedback
“Um, I think ideally, I should go through all my feedback and kind of find the points of commonalities. Erm, and make a list of those and just be aware of those consciously but, again, when you’ve got five hundred things to do... [Laughs] it’s not really on the top of your priority list”


**Sense-making**

I found it useful when my personal tutor went through the feedback and we pointed things out as when someone had originally written a comment which was difficult to understand.

I understood what the feedback meant when my personal tutor read it out loud but if I am reading my own feedback I don’t always understand.

**Synthesis**

You can do individual modules and they could have no relevance to each other but in the meeting you can just see them altogether like how they link in with each other.

I’m clearer now having looked through all my feedback with my tutor. I talked about how I was studying and preparing for the assignments and we discovered that I had not done as much wider reading as I should have.
Supporting synthesis

Section A: Feedback Review and Synthesis Tool
Section B: Skill Development Tool
Section C: Action Planning Tool

https://tinyurl.com/FEATSportfolio
Supporting synthesis

“In the past I’ve struggled to put my feedback into action, whereas FEATS provides real guidance on how to identify your strengths and weaknesses and then points you to resources to develop your skills. The process feels very organic and personalised.”

“FEATS has taught me that it is essential for us to take responsibility for our own learning.”

“By using FEATS, I have been able to understand and overcome weaknesses in my writing”
Using the DEFT to support students’ synthesis of feedback

Portfolio: Synthesising feedback
TAKING ACTION ON FEEDBACK
Developing recipience skills

Individual differences in self-reported use of assessment feedback: the mediating role of feedback beliefs

Naomi E. Winstone\textsuperscript{a}, Erica G. Hepper\textsuperscript{b} and Robert A. Nash\textsuperscript{c}

\textsuperscript{a}Department of Higher Education, University of Surrey, Guildford, UK; \textsuperscript{b}School of Psychology, University of Surrey, Guildford, UK; \textsuperscript{c}School of Health and Life Sciences, Aston University, Birmingham, UK

“Supporting students to feel competent in using feedback should be a key priority for interventions.”
Supporting Learners’ Agentic Engagement With Feedback: A Systematic Review and a Taxonomy of Recipience Processes

Naomi E. Winstone,¹ Robert A. Nash,² Michael Parker,¹ and James Rowntree¹

¹School of Psychology, University of Surrey, Guildford, United Kingdom
²School of Life and Health Sciences, Aston University, Birmingham, United Kingdom

Developing recipience skills
Using the DEFT to support students’ action on feedback

Workshop:
A1 The process of action
A2 Identifying action
A3 Action planning

Portfolio:
Action planning log
Questions for further consideration

• What are the key differences in supporting students of different ability levels to use feedback effectively?
• How can Academic Tutors support students to see beyond the grade to the useful developmental information contained within feedback?
• How can Academic Tutors support students to proactively seek feedback?
• How might the role of the Academic Tutor in relation to feedback change over the course of the student’s programme of study?
• How can Academic Tutors support students to use their engagement with feedback to support their preparation for the workplace?